FINDINGS OF PEER REVIEW BY EXPERTS

ICSI REGISTERED VALUERS ORGANISATION

OBJECTIVES OF PEER REVIEW

- To harmonise work done by Registered Valuers
- To enhance the quality of professional work
- To comply with the regulatory requirements
- To put in place proper documentation system

KEY ISSUES IN PEER REVIEW - 1/2

- Purpose of peer review
- Criteria to select reports for peer review
- Depth & Width-Percentage to be reviewed
- Review suo-moto or/and by RVO
- Eligibility criteria for reviewer
- Location for Peer Review RVO-RV-Reviewer?
- Frequency to conduct peer review

KEY ISSUES IN PEER REVIEW - 2/2

- Cost of peer review who will bear?
- Training Mechanism for Peer Reviewers
- Feedback Mechanism
- Can PR finding results in disciplinary proceedings?
- Benefits to reviewed person
- Confidentiality in Peer Review

S.N	Description	Response 1 HD	Response 2 AG	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
1	Rule 8					
(a)	Utilised IVS	Not Specified	Applied	Not covered	Covered	Not Covered
(b)	Utilised other VS	Complied	N.A	Not covered	Covered	Not Covered
(c)	Scope of work IVS 101 or otherwise	No reference to IVS 101	Covered	No Comments	Covered	Not Covered
2	Valuation Report conducted by another Registered Valuer of different asset class - P&M	NA	NA	Not Required	NA	NA

S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
	Valuation Report conducted by another Registered Valuer of different asset class- L&B	NA	NA	Not required	NA	NA
	Valuation Report conducted by another Registered Valuer of different asset class- FA	issued the	NA	Not required	SFA Valuer issued the report	SFA Valuer issued the report
	Valuation Report conducted by another Registered Valuer as Expert of Particular Asset	No	NA	Not required	NA	NA

AND DESCRIPTION OF THE PARTY OF						
S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
3	Valuer has stated in his report					
а	background information of the asset being valued	Covered	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	Covered
b	purpose of valuation and appointing authority	Covered	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	Covered
С	identity of the valuer and any other experts involved in the valuation	specifically	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	Covered
d	disclosure of valuer interest or conflict, if any	Covered	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	Covered

S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
е	date of appointment, valuati on date and date of report	DOA: Missing Date of VD &VR mentioned	Covered	Not Covered	DOA: Missing Date of VD &VR mentioned	Covered
f	inspections and/or investigations undertaken	No specific heading in the report	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	Point covered as "Not Conducted"
g	nature and sources of the information used or relied upon	Covered	Covered but calculation cost of Equity & WACC not provided	Covered	Covered	Covered
h	procedures adopted in carrying out the valuation standards	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered

followed

S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
İ	restrictions on use of the report if any	Covered	Covered	Required to be mentioned as per rule 8	Covered	Covered
j	major factors that were taken into account during the valuation	Covered	Covered	Required to be mentioned as per rule 8	Covered	Covered
k	conclusion and	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered
	caveats, limitations and disclaimers	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered

S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
4	Intended users for Valuation Report					
а	Clear & accurate description of the scope of assignment	Covered	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	Covered
b	Clear & accurate description of the purpose of assignment	Covered	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	(Conclusion not fully aligned with purpose)
С	Clear & accurate description of the intended use of assignment	Covered	Not Covered	Not Covered	Covered	
d	Disclosure of assumptions	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered

S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
е	Disclosure of special assumptions	No such disclosure	NA	Covered	Nil	Nil
f	IVS 104 Bases of Value para 200.4	Covered but IVS 104 not mentioned			Covered	Covered
g	Significant uncertainty that directly affect the Valuation	Covered	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	Not Covered
h	Limiting Conditions that directly affect the Valuation	Covered	Covered	Not Covered	Covered	Covered
i	Comprehensive narrative report or	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered	Covered

S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
j	Abbrivativ Summery Report	No	No		No	No
k	Variations from standards	No	No		No	Standards not mentioned
	Additional requirements reported for Variations from standards	No	NA	Not Covered	Nil	Nil
m	Relevant IVS Asset Standards referred if any	No	NA	Not Covered	Covered	NA (Not Covered)

S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
5	Compliance sufficient to communicate to the intended users	Covered	No Comments	Not Covered	Covered	Covered
	Compliance sufficient to communicate the scope of valuation assignment	Covered	No Comments	Not Covered	Covered	Conclusion not aligned with purpose
	Compliance sufficient to communicate work performed	Covered	No Comments	Covered	Covered	Conclusion not aligned with purpose

S.No	Description	Response 1	Response 2	Response 3	Response 4	Response 5
	Compliance sufficient to communicate conclusions reached	Covered	No Comments	Covered	Covered	Conclusion not aligned with purpose
	Compliance sufficient to communicate to review the report	Covered	No Comments	Covered	Covered	Conclusion not aligned with purpose
	Compliance sufficient to communicate principal reasons for conclusions reached	Covered	No Comments	Covered	Covered	Conclusion not aligned with purpose

Valuation is both an "Art" & "Science"

